



## A Man who Breaks the Fast before Evening, Thinking that Evening has Come باب الرجل يفطر قبل المساء ويظن أنه قد أمسى

Shaykh ‘Abd al-Ḥayy al-Luknawī

Translated by al-Kakazai

Released by [www.marifah.net](http://www.marifah.net) 1430 H

365 - أخبرنا مالك أخبرنا زيد بن أسلم : أن عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه أفطر في يوم رمضان في يوم غيم ورأى أنه قد أمسى أو غابت الشمس فجاءه رجل فقال : يا أمير المؤمنين قد طلعت الشمس قال : الخطب يسير وقد اجتهدنا

قال محمد : من أفطر وهو يرى أن الشمس قد غابت ثم علم أنها لم تغب لم يأكل بقية يومه ولم يشرب وعليه قضاؤه وهو قول أبي حنيفة رحمه الله

365. Mālik informed us: “Zayd b. Aslam informed us that ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb broke the fast on a day of Ramaḍān, an overcast day, thinking evening had come, the sun having disappeared. A man came to him and said, ‘Amīr al-Mu’minīn, the sun has appeared. He said, ‘It is simple; we had tried our best.’”

Muḥammad said: “Whoever breaks the fast thinking that the sun has set, and then learns that it has not set, should not eat for the rest of that day, nor drink, and he must make up that day. That is the verdict of Abu Ḥanīfah, may Allah have mercy on him.”

**Shaykh ‘Abd al-Ḥayy al-Luknawī commenting on this added:**

And this is the view of the other Imāms and the majority (*jamhūr*) due its being clearly stated in the story of the breaking of the fast (*iftār*) of ‘Umar. Ibn Abi Shaibah narrates from Ḥanzalah that he said:

“I saw ‘Umar in Ramaḍān and a drink was placed near him. Some of the people drank thinking that the sun had set. When the Mu’adhin climbed up he said: O Commander of the believers, by Allah the sun is still present and has not set. ‘Umar said: Whoever

broke their fast then let them fast a day in its place, and he who did not break their fast then let them complete their fast until the sun set...”

It is supported by that which is in Saḥīḥ al-Bukharī from Mu’ammār from Hishām b. ‘Urwah from his father from ‘Asma that she said:

“We broke our fast during the time of the Messenger of Allah on an overcast day, the sun then appeared. It was said to Hishām: Were they ordered to make it up? He replied: It had to be made up for.”

A group were of the view that it was not necessary to make up (the fast) in a scenario such as this basing it on that which is related in some of the versions of the story of ‘Umars breaking the fast that he said: “We do not make it up”.

However Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr and others said: This is a weak narration and that which is correct is the transmission of the trustworthy narrators.

